

# STATE OF NEW JERSEY

Board of Public Utilities
44 South Clinton Avenue, 1st Floor
Post Office Box 350
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350
www.nj.gov/bpu/

## **ENERGY AND CLEAN ENERGY**

IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF NEW	)	ORDER SUSPENDING
JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY FOR	)	PROCEDURAL SCHEDULE
APPROVAL OF NEW ENERGY EFFICIENCY,	)	
BUILDING DECARBONIZATION START-UP, AND	)	
DEMAND RESPONSE PROGRAMS AND THE	)	DOCKET NO. QO23120868
ASSOCIATED COST RECOVERY MECHANISM	)	
PURSUANT TO THE CLEAN ENERGY ACT, N.J.S.A.	)	
48:3-87.8 ET SEQ. AND 48:3-98.1 ET SEQ. SECOND	)	
TRIENNIUM	)	

#### Parties of Record:

Brian O. Lipman, Esq., Director, New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel
Andrew K. Dembia, Esq., Regulatory Affairs Counsel, New Jersey Natural Gas Company
John Kolesnik, Esq., Counsel for the Energy Efficiency Alliance of New Jersey
Steven S. Goldenberg, Esq., Counsel for the New Jersey Large Energy Users Coalition
Kaitlin Morrison, Esq. and Maggie Broughton, Esq., Counsel for the New Jersey Progressive
Equitable Energy Coalition, the Natural Resources Defense Council, and the Sierra Club

BY COMMISSIONER MARIAN ABDOU:

## BACKGROUND AND PROCEDURAL HISTORY

By Order dated May 24, 2023, the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board") directed each electric and gas public utility to propose, for Board approval, energy efficiency ("EE") programs for the second three-year EE program period ("Triennium 2") on or before October 2, 2023, and the Board addressed certain aspects of the Triennium 2 framework.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> In re the Implementation of P.L. 2018, c. 17, the New Jersey Clean Energy Act of 2018, Regarding the Establishment of Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Programs; In re the Implementation of P.L. 2018, c. 17, the New Jersey Clean Energy Act of 2018, Regarding the Second Triennium of Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Programs; In re Electric Public Utilities and Gas Public Utilities Offering Energy Efficiency and Conservation Programs, Investing in Class I Renewable Energy Resources and Offering Class I Renewable Energy Programs in Their Respective Service Territories on a Regulated Basis, Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1 and N.J.S.A. 48:3-87.9 - Minimum Filing Requirements, BPU Docket Nos. QO19010040, QO23030150, and QO17091004, Order dated May 24, 2023 ("May 2023 Order").

By Order dated July 26, 2023, the Board approved the remaining aspects of the Triennium 2 framework.<sup>2</sup>

By Order dated September 27, 2023, the Board extended the filing deadline for Triennium 2 petitions from October 2, 2023 to December 1, 2023 and directed that any entities seeking to intervene or participate in this matter file the appropriate application with the Board by December 8, 2023 and that entities file with the Board any responses to those motions by December 14, 2023.<sup>3</sup> By the September 2023 Order, the Board retained this matter for hearing and, pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:2-32, designated President Guhl-Sadovy as Presiding Commissioner in this matter. By Order dated October 25, 2023, the Board delayed the start of Triennium 2 by six (6) months from July 1, 2024, until January 1, 2025.<sup>4</sup>

By Order dated January 10, 2024, the Board redesignated President Guhl-Sadovy as the Presiding Commissioner for the Public Service Electric and Gas Company ("PSE&G") filing and designated myself, Commissioner Abdou, as the Presiding Commissioner in this matter, authorized to rule on all motions that arise during the pendency of this proceeding and modify schedules that may be set as necessary to secure a just and expeditious determination of all issues.<sup>5</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> In re the Implementation of P.L. 2018, c. 17, the New Jersey Clean Energy Act of 2018, Regarding the Establishment of Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Programs; In re the Implementation of P.L. 2018, c. 17, the New Jersey Clean Energy Act of 2018, Regarding the Second Triennium of Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Programs; In re Electric Public Utilities and Gas Public Utilities Offering Energy Efficiency and Conservation Programs, Investing in Class I Renewable Energy Resources and Offering Class I Renewable Energy Programs in Their Respective Service Territories on a Regulated Basis, Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1 and N.J.S.A. 48:3-87.9 - Minimum Filing Requirements, BPU Docket Nos. QO19010040, QO23030150, and QO17091004, Order dated July 26, 2023.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> In re the Implementation of P.L. 2018, c. 17, the New Jersey Clean Energy Act of 2018, Regarding the Establishment of Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Programs; In re the Implementation of P.L. 2018, c. 17, the New Jersey Clean Energy Act of 2018, Regarding the Second Triennium of Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Programs; In re Electric Public Utilities and Gas Public Utilities Offering Energy Efficiency and Conservation Programs, Investing in Class I Renewable Energy Resources and Offering Class I Renewable Energy Programs in Their Respective Service Territories on a Regulated Basis, Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1 and N.J.S.A. 48:3-87.9 - Minimum Filing Requirements, BPU Docket Nos. QO19010040, QO23030150, and QO17091004, Order dated September 27, 2023 ("September 2023 Order"). The September 2023 Order also directed that any entity wishing to file a motion for admission of counsel, pro hac vice, should do so concurrently with any motion to intervene or participate. No entity filed a motion for admission pro hac vice in this matter.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> In re the Implementation of P.L. 2018, c. 17, the New Jersey Clean Energy Act of 2018, Regarding the Second Triennium of Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Programs, BPU Docket No. QO23030150, Order dated October 25, 2023 ("October 2023 Order"). The October 2023 Order also extended Triennium 1 through December 31, 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> In re the Implementation of P.L. 2018, c. 17, the New Jersey Clean Energy Act of 2018, Regarding the Second Triennium of Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Programs et al., BPU Docket Nos. QO23030150, QO23120868, QO23120869, QO23120870, QO23120871, QO23120872, QO23120874, and QO23120875, Order dated January 10, 2024 ("January 2024 Order"). By the January 2024 Order, the Board additionally redesignated Commissioner Abdou as the Presiding Commissioner for the Elizabethtown Gas Company ("ETG") and South Jersey Gas Company ("SJG") fillings, BPU Docket Nos. QO23120869 and QO23120870.

On December 1, 2023, New Jersey Natural Gas Company ("NJNG" or "Petitioner") filed the requisite petition with the Board ("Petition"), and on December 26, 2023, Board Staff ("Staff") issued NJNG a letter of administrative deficiency ("Letter") identifying administratively incomplete portions of the Petition and requesting that the Company cure any deficiencies. On January 2, 2024, NJNG filed an update to the Petition to cure the deficiencies identified in the Letter ("Update"). N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1(b) provides the Board with 180 days to approve, modify, or deny the Company's requested recovery of costs for the Program. The 180-day review period commenced on January 2, 2024 for the Petition.

In the January 2024 Order, the Board directed that any entity wishing to file a motion for leave to intervene or participate, or to update a previously-filed motion for leave to intervene or participate, in this proceeding shall have until seven (7) days following Staff's issuance of a letter of administrative completeness to the Company.<sup>6</sup> On January 12, 2024, Staff issued a letter of administrative completeness, noting that the Update adequately cured the deficiencies identified in the Letter and that Staff therefore determined the Petition to be administratively complete. The Board subsequently received no additional or updated motions seeking leave to intervene or participate.

By Order dated February 26, 2024, after considering all Motions to Intervene or Participate in this matter and responses to the Motions, I granted intervenor status to the New Jersey Large Energy Users' Coalition ("NJLEUC"), the Energy Efficiency Alliance of New Jersey ("EEA-NJ"), the Natural Resources Defense Council ("NRDC"), the New Jersey Progressive Equitable Energy Coalition ("NJPEEC"), and the Sierra Club (collectively, "Intervenors"), and participant status to Uplight, Inc. and the joint utilities: Atlantic City Electric Company, ETG, Jersey Central Power & Light Company, PSE&G, Rockland Electric Company, and SJG.<sup>7</sup>

On March 19, 2024, the parties to this matter submitted for approval a stipulation of settlement, proposing to extend the 180-day review period to October 15, 2024 ("Stipulation").

By Order dated April 23, 2024, I approved the Stipulation, extending the 180-day review period to October 15, 2024, and established the procedural schedule for this matter, which was annexed to the Order ("April 23 Procedural Schedule").8

On April 25, 2024, I received correspondence from NJNG seeking to amend the April 23 Procedural Schedule, specifically, by extending the deadline for the New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel ("Rate Counsel") and Intervenors to file testimony by two (2) weeks from April 29, 2024,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> In re the Implementation of P.L. 2018, c. 17, the New Jersey Clean Energy Act of 2018, Regarding the Second Triennium of Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Programs et al., BPU Docket Nos. QO23030150, QO23120868, QO23120869, QO23120870, QO23120871, QO23120872, QO23120874, and QO23120875, Order dated January 10, 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of New Energy Efficiency, Building Decarbonization Start-Up, and Demand Response Programs and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to the Clean Energy Act, N.J.S.A. 48:3-87.8 et seq. and 48:3-98.1 et seq. Second Triennium, BPU Docket No. QO23120868, Order dated February 26, 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of New Energy Efficiency, Building Decarbonization Start-Up, and Demand Response Programs and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to the Clean Energy Act, N.J.S.A. 48:3-87.8 et seq. and 48:3-98.1 et seq. Second Triennium, BPU Docket No. QO23120868, Order dated April 23, 2024.

to May 13, 2024, to allow for further settlement negotiations. NJNG did not request further modification to the April 23 Procedural Schedule in its April 25, 2024, correspondence. According to the correspondence, Rate Counsel, Board Staff, and the Intervenors supported the request. Subsequently, on May 8, 2024, NJNG filed correspondence requesting the filing for Rate Counsel and Intervenor testimony be extended to May 28, 2024. The correspondence indicated that the request was supported by Rate Counsel, Board Staff, and the Intervenors. By Order dated May 15, 2024, I extended the deadline for the filing of Respondent/Intervenor testimony to May 28, 2024, and, with the consent of the parties, suspended the April 23 Procedural Schedule until May 28, 2024.

On May 20, 2024, NJNG filed correspondence seeking to suspend the procedural schedule indefinitely so that the parties may continue settlement negotiations. Rate Counsel and the Intervenors indicated their consent to NJNG's request in writing on May 21 and May 22, 2024. Board Staff indicated its consent to the request on May 24, 2024.

# **DISCUSSION AND FINDINGS**

I reviewed, in detail, the Petitioner's correspondence dated May 20, 2024 requesting a suspension of the Procedural Schedule as the parties work towards a possible settlement. To allow further settlement negotiations and to ensure an equitable determination of the issues, and with the consent of the parties, I <u>HEREBY SUSPEND</u> the April 23 Procedural Schedule in its entirety.

I <u>HEREBY ORDER</u> that the parties shall participate in a status update conference with myself that will occur during the last week of June 2024 to discuss progress made toward settlement and to determine whether to reinstate the April 23 Procedural Schedule. The Parties will be notified of the exact date of the status update conference by email.

I **HEREBY DIRECT** that this Order be posted on the Board's website.

This provisional ruling is subject to ratification or other alteration by the Board as it deems appropriate during the proceedings in this matter.

DATED: June 4, 2024

BY:

COMMISSIONER

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of New Energy Efficiency, Building Decarbonization Start-Up, and Demand Response Programs and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to the Clean Energy Act, N.J.S.A. 48:3-87.8 et seq. and 48:3-98.1 et seq. Second Triennium, BPU Docket No. QO23120868, Order dated May 15, 2024.

IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF NEW ENERGY EFFICIENCY, BUILDING DECARBONIZATION START-UP, AND DEMAND RESPONSE PROGRAMS AND THE ASSOCIATED COST RECOVERY MECHANISM PURSUANT TO THE CLEAN ENERGY ACT, N.J.S.A. 48:3-87.8 ET SEQ. AND 48:3-98.1 ET SEQ. SECOND TRIENNIUM

#### **DOCKET NO. QO23120868**

#### SERVICE LIST

New Jersey Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 1st Floor Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Sherri Golden, Board Secretary board.secretary@bpu.nj.gov

Robert Brabston, Esq., Executive Director robert.brabston@bpu.nj.gov

Stacy Peterson, Deputy Executive Director stacy.peterson@bpu.nj.gov

General Counsel's Office

Michael Beck, General Counsel michael.beck@bpu.nj.gov

Carol Artale, Deputy General Counsel carol.artale@bpu.nj.gov

Steven Athanassopoulos steven.athanassopoulos@bpu.nj.gov

Rachel Boylan rachel.boylan@bpu.nj.gov

Office of the Economist

Benjamin Witherell, Ph.D., Chief Economist benjamin.witherell@bpu.nj.gov

Dianne Crilly dianne.crilly@bpu.nj.gov

Jackie O'Grady jackie.ogrady@bpu.nj.gov

Division of State Energy Services

Sara Bluhm Gibson, Director sara.bluhm@bpu.nj.gov

Michelle Rossi michelle.rossi@bpu.nj.gov NJBPU, cont'd.

Division of Revenue and Rates

Andrew Tuzzo andrew.tuzzo@bpu.nj.gov

Cindy Bianco cindy.bianco@bpu.nj.gov

Division of Clean Energy

Stacy Ho Richardson, Deputy Director <a href="mailto:stacy.richardson@bpu.nj.gov">stacy.richardson@bpu.nj.gov</a>

Kevin Monte de Ramos
Bureau Chief, Energy Efficiency and Building
Decarbonization
kevin.montederamos@bpu.nj.gov

Kevin Nedza kevin.nedza@bpu.nj.gov

Philip Chao philip.chao@bpu.nj.gov

Rupa Deshmukh rupa.deshmukh@bpu.nj.gov

Paul Heitmann paul.heitmann@bpu.nj.gov

Indrani Pal indrani.pal@bpu.nj.gov

Brandee Sullivan brandee.sullivan@bpu.nj.gov

David Titus david.titus@bpu.nj.gov

Alexis Trautman alexis.trautman@bpu.nj.gov

Dustin Wang dustin.wang@bpu.nj.gov

#### **NJBPU Consultants**

Andrew Grant
The Cadmus Group
720 SW Washington St., Suite 400
Portland, OR 97205
andrew.grant@cadmusgroup.com

Jason Meyer
DNV Energy Insights USA Inc.
1400 Ravello Rd
Katy, TX 77449
jason.meyer@dnv.com

Pankaj Lal, PhD
Cassidy Rucker
Montclair State University
426 Center for Environment & Life Sciences
Montclair, NJ 07043
lalp@montclair.edu
ruckerc@montclair.edu

Jennifer Senick
Rutgers Center for Green Building
Edward J. Bloustein School of Planning & Public
Policy
Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey
33 Livingston Ave #158
New Brunswick, NJ 08901
jsenick@rutgers.edu

Lisa Skumatz Skumatz Economic Research Associates PO Box 1486 Silverthorne, CO 80498 skumatz@serainc.com

New Jersey Division of Law
Department of Law & Public Safety
R.J. Hughes Justice Complex, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor West
25 Market Street
Post Office Box 112
Trenton, NJ 08625-0112

Daren Eppley, Section Chief, DAG daren.eppley@law.njoag.gov

Pamela Owen, Assistant Section Chief, DAG <a href="mailto:pamela.owen@law,njoag.gov">pamela.owen@law,njoag.gov</a>

Matko Ilic, DAG matko.ilic@law.njoag.gov

Steven A. Chaplar, DAG steven.chaplar@law.njoag.gov

New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003

Brian Lipman, Esq., Director blipman@rpa.nj.gov

Maura Caroselli, Esq., Managing Attorney mcaroselli@rpa.nj.gov

Megan Lupo, Esq. mlupo@rpa.nj.gov

Mamie W. Purnell, Esq. mpurnell@rpa.nj.gov

Andrew Gold, Esq. agold@rpa.nj.gov

Carlena Morrison, Paralegal <a href="mailto:cmorrison@rpa.nj.gov">cmorrison@rpa.nj.gov</a>

Terrence Coleman, Paralegal tcoleman2@rpa.nj.gov

Rate Counsel Consultants

Robert J. Henkes Henkes Consulting 7 Sunset Road Old Greenwich, CT 06870 rhenkes@optonline.net

Applied Economics Clinic 6 Liberty Square PMB 98162 Boston, MA 02109

Elizabeth A. Stanton, PhD liz.stanton@aeclinic.org

Sumera Patel Sumera.patel@aeclinic.org

Jordan M. Burt jordan.burt@aeclinic.org

Tanya Stasio tanya.stasio@aeclinic.org

## Rate Counsel Consultants, cont'd.

Acadian Consulting Group 5800 One Perkins Place Drive Building 5, Suite F Baton Rouge, LA 70808

David Dismukes, Ph.D. daviddismukes@acadianconsulting.com

Michael Deupree michaeldeupree@acadianconsulting.com

Nicolas Alvarez nicolasalvarez@acadianconsulting.com

Taylor Deshotels taylordeshotels@acadianconsulting.com

Roberto Hasbun robhasbun@acadianconsulting.com

Emily Mouch emilymouch@acadianconsulting.com

Tyler French tylerfrench@acadianconsulting.com

Jackson Gaspard jacksongaspard@acadianconsulting.com

Eastern Environmental Law Center One Gateway Center, Suite 2600 Newark, NJ 07102

Kaitlin Morrison, Esq. kmorrison@easternenvironmental.org

Maggie Broughton, Esq. mbroughton@easternenvironmental.org

Energy Efficiency Alliance of New Jersey John M. Kolesnik, Esq., Policy Counsel 614 S. 4<sup>th</sup> St., #307 Philadelphia, PA 19147 ikolesnik@eeaofni.org

New Jersey Large Energy Users Coalition Steven S. Goldenberg, Esq. Giordano, Halleran & Ciesla, P.C. 125 Half Mile Road, Suite 300 Red Bank, NJ 07701-6777 sgoldenberg@ghclaw.com New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road P.O. Box 1464 Wall, New Jersey 07719

Andrew K. Dembia, Esq., Regulatory Affairs Counsel adembia@ning.com

Mark G. Kahrer mkahrer@njng.com

James Corcoran jcorcoran@njng.com

Anne-Marie Peracchio aperacchio@njng.com

Tina Trebino ttrebino@njng.com

Judy DeSalvatore jdesalvatore@njng.com

Todd Van Aken tvanaken@njng.com

Susan Fastuca sfantuca@njng.com

Mary Lou Pardey mpardeym@njng.com

Uplight
Norris McLaughlin, P.A.
400 Crossing Boulevard, 8th Floor
P.O. Box 5933
Bridgewater, NJ 08807

James H. Laskey, Esq. <u>ilaskey@norris-law.com</u>

Anthony D'Elia adelia@norris-law.com

Neil Veilleux Uplight Inc. 2350 Junction PI, Ste 200 Boulder, CO 80301 neil.veilleux@uplight.com

Rockland Electric Company
Margaret Comes, Esq., Associate Counsel
4 Irving Place
New York, New York 10003
comesm@coned.com

Atlantic City Electric Company 92DC42 500 North Wakefield Drive P.O. Box 6066 Newark, DE 19702-6066

Philip J. Passanante, Esq. Assistant General Counsel philip.passanante@pepcoholdings.com

Nathanael Gillespie
nathanael.gillespie@exeloncorp.com

Jacob B. Sneeden jacob.sneeden@exeloncorp.com

Jessica Yu jessica.yu@exeloncorp.com

Heather Hall heather.hall@pepcoholdings.com

Imran Bell imran.bell@exeloncorp.com

Daniel Anderson danderson@pepco.com

Ruth C. Kiselewich ruth.kiselewich@exeloncorp.com

Susan Marinelli smarinelli@pepcoholdings.com

Sherryl Chen <a href="mailto:sherryl.chen@pepcoholdings.com">sherryl.chen@pepcoholdings.com</a>

Brendon Baatz brendon@gabelassociates.com

Public Service Electric and Gas Company
Stacey M. Mickles, Associate Counsel – Regulatory
Law Department
PSEG Services Corporation
80 Park Plaza – T10
Newark, New Jersey 07102-4194
stacey.mickles@pseg.com

# Elizabethtown Gas Company & South Jersey Gas Company

Sheree Kelly, Esq., Regulatory Affairs Counsel South Jersey Industries 520 Green Lane Union, NJ 07083 <a href="mailto:skelly@sjindustries.com">skelly@sjindustries.com</a>

#### **Jersey Central Power & Light Company**

Michael Martelo, Esq., Attorney 300 Madison Avenue P.O. Box 1911 Morristown, NJ 07962-1911 mmartelo@firstenergycorp.com

Kurt E. Turosky
Diane L. Rapp
76 South Main
Akron, Ohio 44308
turoskyk@firstenergycorp.com
drapp@firstenergycorp.com

Edward C. Miller
Eric R. Rundy
800 Cabin Hill Drive
Greensburg, Pennsylvania 15601
emille3@firstenergycorp.com
erundy@firstenergycorp.com

Mackenzie Klie 14997 Park Ave Ext Meadville, Pennsylvania 16335 mklie@firstenergycorp.com

Kori R. Auman-Krebs Viktor Lackmann 2800 Pottsville Pike Reading, Pennsylvania 19605 kauman@firstenergycorp.com vlackmann@firstenergycorp.com